



16 CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS

16.2 COMMUNITY INFRASTRUCTURE PROJECT - AWARDING OF CONTRACT (SWIMMING POOL REFURBISHMENT)

RECOMMENDATION TO MOVE INTO CONFIDENCE

That:

1. Pursuant to Section 90(2) & (3) of the Local Government Act 1999 the Council orders that the public, with the exception of the Chief Executive Officer be excluded from attendance at the meeting held on Wednesday 21 August 2019 for Agenda Item 16.2 Community Infrastructure Project - Awarding of Contract (Swimming Pool Refurbishment);
2. The Council is satisfied that pursuant to section 90 (3) (k) of the Local Government Act 1999, the information to be received, discussed or considered in relation to the Agenda Item 16.2 Community Infrastructure Project - Awarding of Contract (Swimming Pool Refurbishment) is:

tenders for the supply of goods, the provision of services or the carrying out of works.
3. The Council is satisfied that the principle that the meeting be conducted in a place open to the public has been outweighed by the need to discuss this Agenda Item 16.2 in confidence.

**MOVED COUNCILLOR NEVILLE PFEIFFER
SECONDED COUNCILLOR PAUL IRELAND**

That:

1. Pursuant to Section 90(2) & (3) of the Local Government Act 1999 the Council orders that the public, with the exception of the Chief Executive Officer, Manager Corporate Services, Manager Infrastructure Services, Coordinator Executive Services and minute secretary be excluded from attendance at the meeting held on Wednesday 21 August 2019 for Agenda Item 16.2 Community Infrastructure Project - Awarding of Contract (Swimming Pool Refurbishment);
2. The Council is satisfied that pursuant to section 90 (3) (k) of the Local Government Act 1999, the information to be received, discussed or considered in relation to the Agenda Item 16.2 Community Infrastructure Project - Awarding of Contract (Swimming Pool Refurbishment) is:

tenders for the supply of goods, the provision of services or the carrying out of works.
3. The Council is satisfied that the principle that the meeting be conducted in a place open to the public has been outweighed by the need to discuss this Agenda Item 16.2 in confidence.

CARRIED.

16 CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS

16.2 COMMUNITY INFRASTRUCTURE PROJECT - AWARDING OF CONTRACT (SWIMMING POOL REFURBISHMENT)

Responsible officer: Jason Taylor, Chief Executive Officer

Attachments: 1. **Quotation evaluation report - Pinnaroo and Lameroo swimming pool refurbishment** ↓

Section under the Act	The grounds on which part of the Council or Committee may be closed to the public are listed in Section 90(2) & (3) of the <i>Local Government Act 1999</i> .
Sub-clause and Reason:	(k) - tenders for the supply of goods, the provision of services or the carrying out of works.

Executive Summary

The purpose of this report is to enable Council to determine the awarding of the lump sum contract for the refurbishment of the change rooms at the community swimming pools in Pinnaroo and Lameroo. There is a detailed quotation evaluation report attached to this report.

Council allocated \$130,000 of the Commonwealth Government’s \$1 million of funding under the Drought Communities Programme to the pool renewal in late 2018. The pool renewal was part of the larger Southern Mallee Community Infrastructure Project (SMCIP) suite of projects.

In its 2019/20 annual business plan and budget Council also allocated \$50,000 for pool upgrade works (Pinnaroo and Lameroo) and \$50,000 for solar installations at pools (Pinnaroo and Lameroo).

Council has already expended \$15,525 on the painting of all timber work, doors and pool furniture at both pools and \$3,150 on the design of refurbishment of the pool change rooms. The remaining project budget is \$111,325.

The preferred contractor for the refurbishment of the change rooms has provided two quotations (one for each pool) with a total quotation amount of \$201,412.84. This exceeds the remaining budget under the SMCIP program by \$90,087.84.

The \$50,000 allocation in this year’s budget for pool upgrade works can be used for the change room refurbishment. This report also seeks Council approval to reallocate the \$50,000 for solar installations at pools to the change room refurbishment.

The preferred contractor is Scott Meneghetti Carpentry for a lump sum contract price of \$201,412.84 (excluding GST).

RECOMMENDATION**That Council**

1. endorses the use of the \$50,000 budget for pool upgrade works (Pinnaroo and Lameroo) for the refurbishment of the change rooms at the community swimming pools in Pinnaroo and Lameroo
2. approves the reallocation of the \$50,000 for solar installations at pools (Pinnaroo and Lameroo) from the solar program of works to the refurbishment of the change rooms at the community swimming pools in Pinnaroo and Lameroo.
3. awards the lump sum contract for the refurbishment of the change rooms at the community swimming pools in Pinnaroo and Lameroo to Scott Meneghetti Carpentry for a contract price of \$201,412.84 (excluding GST)

MOVED COUNCILLOR PAUL IRELAND**SECONDED COUNCILLOR TREVOR HANCOCK****That Council**

1. endorses the use of the \$50,000 budget for pool upgrade works (Pinnaroo and Lameroo) for the refurbishment of the change rooms at the community swimming pools in Pinnaroo and Lameroo
2. approves the reallocation of the \$50,000 for solar installations at pools (Pinnaroo and Lameroo) from the solar program of works to the refurbishment of the change rooms at the community swimming pools in Pinnaroo and Lameroo.
3. awards the lump sum contract for the refurbishment of the change rooms at the community swimming pools in Pinnaroo and Lameroo to Scott Meneghetti Carpentry for a contract price of \$201,412.84 (excluding GST)

CARRIED.

Background

Council commissioned detailed designs for the bathroom refurbishments at the community swimming pools in Pinnaroo and Lameroo. Those designs were then used to support the request for quotation process. Council sought quotations from three firms with two making submissions.

Context

Council at its meeting on 21 November 2018 endorsed the development of the Pinnaroo and Lameroo childcare developments and the Pinnaroo and Lameroo swimming pool upgrades as the projects to be funded by the Commonwealths Government's Drought Communities Programme.

The project budget for the pool renewal work was \$130,000.

Council has already completed all painting works at the pools including painting all timber work, doors, some guttering and downpipes and pool furniture.

Policy and statutory implications

Council has undertaken the request for quotation process and evaluation in accordance with its Procurement policy.

Issues

Council has been progressing the pool renewal works since the start of this year and has focused on the external painting of building timber work, doors and furniture, designing the change room refurbishments and undertaking the refurbishments.

All painting works at both pools is now complete. This work included extensive painting of external timber surfaces and pool furniture and some replacement of rotten fascia boards. The design of the bathroom refurbishments at both pools is also complete. To date the painting and design works have cost a total of \$18,675. As a result the remaining budget is \$111,325.

Endorsement of the use of the \$50,000 budget for pool upgrade works (Pinnaroo and Lameroo) for the refurbishment of the change rooms and approval to reallocate the \$50,000 for solar installations at pools (Pinnaroo and Lameroo) from the solar program of works to the refurbishment of the change rooms would result in an additional budget of \$100,000. This would result in a new remaining project budget of \$211,325.

The budget remaining after the completion of the bathroom refurbishment would be used for any other high importance renewal works at the pool such as pool line marking. The solar projects at the pools would continue to be progressed as design projects for potential delivery next financial year.

Alternate options

Council could decide not to reallocate the \$50,000 for solar installations at pools (Pinnaroo and Lameroo) from the solar program of works to the refurbishment of the change rooms at the community swimming pools in Pinnaroo and Lameroo. This would mean that only one bathroom refurbishment could proceed.

Financial implications

The total project budget for the pool renewal works, from the Commonwealth Government Drought Communities Program, is \$65,000 per site or a total of \$130,000.

Council's 2019/20 capital works program includes \$50,000 for pool upgrade works (Pinnaroo and Lameroo) and \$50,000 for solar installations at pools (Pinnaroo and Lameroo).

Work Health and Safety and Risk implications

This report raises no new work health and safety issues. A decision not to deliver the two pool refurbishment projects would be a risk to Council's reputation. Recent consultation on the swimming pools indicated the community considered change room renewal a higher priority than solar installation.

Consultation

The community was consulted on our aquatic services and pool facilities at the end of the 2018/19 summer pool season. There is significant community support for the pool renewal works that Council is undertaking.

Quotation evaluation report

Pinnaroo and Lameroo Swimming Pool Refurbishment

1. Contract details

- 1.1 Type of contract:
This contract is a lump sum contract.
- 1.2 Term of contract:
28 August 2019 until 30 September 2019
- 1.3 Budget:
Commonwealth Government funding and Council's current year budget

2. Submitters

Two quotations were received by the closing date of 25 July 2019 at 5:00 pm.

Submitter	PRICE
Scott Meneghetti Carpentry	\$201,412.84
Handbuilt Homes Riverland	\$199,448.18

Both quotations are considered to be conforming with the specification.

3. Evaluation panel

An evaluation panel was formed to evaluate the quotations received consisting of:

- CEO, Jason Taylor
- Property & Development Services Officer, Sara Hughes

4. Evaluation criteria

The quotations were evaluated according to the following criteria in order of priority and weighting:

- 1. Cost to council (direct and indirect) 50%
- 2. Response to specification/project brief 25%
- 3. Experience and qualifications 25%
- 4. Risk management %
- 5. Business capacity %
- 6. Financial capacity %
- 7. Quality management %

Selection Criteria 1 – Cost to Council				
<p>- Direct</p> <p>The tender/quotation price submitted for the provision of goods, services or works.</p> <p>- Indirect</p> <p>All costs associated with the management, including risk management and contract management, of the contract supervision shall be applied consistently to each tender submission. For example contract supervision, asset resource utilisation and risk management. Should significant differences in requirement of Council be apparent the comparative indirect costs borne by Council must form part of the evaluation.</p>				
No.	Submitter		Comments	Score
1.	Scott Carpentry	Meneghetti	Quotation less for Pinnaroo than Hand Built and more for Lameroo Both quotes very close in price on 2% difference	Score 45 out of 50
2.	Handbuilt Riverland	Homes		Score 47.5 out of 50

Selection Criteria 2 – Response to specification/project brief				
<p>A specification/project brief is a clear, complete and accurate statement of the description and technical requirements of a material, an item or a service. It may include the procedure to be followed to determine if the requirements are met.</p> <p>The submissions should incorporate a statement noting compliance or non compliance with the specification requirements. The tenders/quotations should also detail their proposed methodology to comply with the specification.</p>				
No.	Submitter		Comments	Score
1.	Scott Carpentry	Meneghetti	Very detailed description of works	Score 22.5 out of 25
2.	Handbuilt Riverland	Homes	Very limited description of works	Score 17.5 out of 25

Selection Criteria 3 – Experience and qualifications			
Details of the submitter’s previous experience with similar projects together with the qualifications of the submitting firm’s proposed staffing.			
No.	Submitter	Comments	Score
1.	Scott Meneghetti Carpentry	Evidence of experience with unique projects, such as renovations and remodeling of existing buildings	Score 20 out of 25
2.	Handbuilt Riverland Homes	Company has a great focus on new builds	Score 17.5 out of 25

TOTAL SCORES		
No.	Submitter	Total scores
1.	Scott Meneghetti Carpentry	Score 87.5 out of 100
2.	Handbuilt Homes Riverland	Score 82.5 out of 100

6. Evaluation

6.1 Evaluation scores

Submitter	Score
Scott Meneghetti Carpentry	87.5
Handbuilt Homes Riverland	82.5

As can be seen **Scott Meneghetti Carpentry** scored highest against the evaluation criteria.

7. Issues of concern

There are no issues of concern with Scott Meneghetti Carpentry. His quotation and project experiences demonstrates he has the capacity to deliver this project to a high quality.


8. Summary

Scott Meneghetti provided a detailed quotation for this work demonstrating a solid understanding of the project. He has considerable experience with bespoke building projects and works well with his client.

9. Recommendation of evaluation panel

That Council awards the lump sum contract for the refurbishment of the change rooms at the community swimming pools in Pinnaroo and Lameroo to Scott Meneghetti Carpentry for a contract price of \$201,412.84 (excluding GST).

Evaluation panel

Name: Sara Hughes Signature:  Date: 9/08/2019

Name: Jason Taylor Signature:  Date: 9/08/2019

RECOMMENDATION TO COME OUT OF CONFIDENCE

That having considered agenda Item 16.2 in confidence under section 90 (2) and (3) (k) of the Local Government Act 1999, the Council pursuant to section 91 (7) of the Act orders that the documents considered by the Council, including the officer's report and all minutes be retained in confidence. This order is to be reviewed at or before the ordinary Council meeting to be held in January 2020, as to if this order is to continue in operation.

MOVED COUNCILLOR REBECCA BOSELEY**SECONDED COUNCILLOR PAUL IRELAND**

That having considered agenda Item 16.2 in confidence under section 90 (2) and (3) (k) of the Local Government Act 1999, the Council pursuant to section 91 (7) of the Act orders that the documents considered by the Council, including the officer's report and all minutes be retained in confidence. This order is to be reviewed at or before the ordinary Council meeting to be held in January 2020, as to if this order is to continue in operation.

CARRIED.